

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT

Country: Republic of Moldova

CSO Name: National Institute for Women of Moldova "Equality"

Project Title: "Fighting Corruption in Public Health Services"

Progress Report as of 10.01.2011

I. Summary of Progress

Plan of operations was realistic; we have fulfilled all planned events on time. Events within the project were reasonable and adequate for the successful realization of the project.

The planned results have been completely achieved. The results correspond to the set up aims and tasks of the project.

The given project was useful not only for the society but also for the organization. We have acquired some experience in the realization of anticorruption projects. We have realized that the project activity, even if there is the high efficacy of the projects that are being put into life, will not be able to provide the required stability and continuity of work, if it is not supported by the state and local bodies.

Support of the project by Administration of Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs of the Republic of Moldova and Ministry of Health of the Republic of Moldova was very useful.

We have concluded the agreement on the partnership in the written form with the Medical Department of Ministry of Home Affairs of the Republic of Moldova. The agreement embraced all the liabilities of the parties. This agreement ensures the fulfillment of all the actions of the project. The main change that has taken place in the given period is the replacement of the coordinator of the project (it was done with the concurrence of PTF).

As a result, all the actions that were planned in the given period have been fulfilled, as well as all the goals that were set in the given period have been attained.

Issue 6 (in June) of the journal "Law and Life" where among the founders there is the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Home Affairs has pointed out that one of the most significant problems for Moldova is corruption. The National Institute for Women of Moldova "Equality" with the support of Partnership for Transparency Fund has been realizing the project on prevention of corruption in the sphere of health care. Within the given project the collection of laws "No Corruption" has been published. The book will greatly influence on the improvement of the quality of preventing corruption, as well it will serve as a great help for specialists and common people for filling the gap in information.

The importance of the laws that have been included in the book is proven by a great practical significance of the book. Also, within the given anticorruption project the Code of Ethics has been worked out. The Code is aimed at prevention of corruption.

The practical character of events that were carried out within the project have promoted both the increase of great interest of participants towards the events of the project and the enhance of their activity in the struggle against corruption. The fact that these kinds of projects that promote the significant decrease of the level of corruption are being implemented into practice in Moldova cannot but make common people happy (journal “Law and Life”, Issue 6, Pag. 42-43)

II. Basic Project Data

1. Date Project grant signed: March, 2010
2. Date Project implementation commenced: March, 2010
3. Expected Date of Project completion:
 - A. Original: February, 2011
 - B. Planned: February, 2011
4. Summary of project goal and objectives:

The goal: to decrease the level of corruption in public health services of Moldova

Project objectives:

- a) To inoculate the intolerance to corruption among patients and doctors according to the recommendations of the National Strategy for Corruption Prevention and Fighting.
- b) Increase of patients' awareness of their rights and ways of struggle against corruption in public health services.
- c) The implementation of anticorruption mechanisms in the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs of the Republic of Moldova.

III. Implementation Progress

Planned Activity¹	Brief Description of Progress, Emerging Problems and Remedial Actions²	Description of any major change in the activity with reason³
<p>1. The realization of survey among patients and doctors of Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs of the Republic of Moldov.</p>	<p>This survey has detected the major corruption problems in Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs of the Republic of Moldova and in public health services. The results of this survey will be used for working out the recommendations on the decrease of the level of corruption.</p> <p>The participants of the public opinion poll have clarified their vision of corruption and the harm of corruption. 96 percent of the participants of the poll have the opinion that in the system of health services in Moldova exists the high level of corruption, 85 percent of the respondents had to face personally the corruption in public health services, 81percent gave the reward to doctors (93 percent of them) have pointed out that they were scared to be provided with a bad treatment without giving a bribe to a doctor. Beneficiaries: 320 patients and doctors of Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs of the Moldova.</p> <p>The results of the questionnaire have been made public during the Anti-corruption Commission meeting; they have also been exposed for the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs doctors and patients. The results of the questionnaires have been used for drawing up the Code of Anticorruption Ethics of the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs. Besides, the results of the questionnaires have served as a motivation for inviting the Center for Combating Economic Crimes and Corruption members to lecture on anticorruption subjects. The questionnaire has revealed that most of the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs employees does not understand the essence of corruption, and most of them do not regard presents as bribes. According to the anticorruption committee’s decision, the Ministry of Home Affairs</p>	<p>As planned</p>

¹ These activities are as listed in the Project Proposal and should correspond to the log-frame. Feel free to elaborate as necessary.

² Briefly describe the progress or lack thereof during the quarter being reported as well as cumulative as of the end of the period. Also, discuss concisely any significant problems encountered and action taken to overcome them. For activities not yet initiated, say, “Not yet started”.

³ No need for any comment if there is no change, say, “As planned”.

	<p>Polyclinic administration has taken the following decision based on the results of the questionnaire: the staff shall have scheduled assessment based on the Code of Anticorruption Ethics of the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs and the anticorruption lectures held.</p>	
<p>2. The creation of the standing Anti-corruption Commission in the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs of the Republic of Moldova.</p>	<p>The working group having the aim of creating a commission had its first sitting in March. The principles of the commission's work were worked out, the composition of the commission was agreed, and the leading bodies were elected. On the basis of the findings and recommendations of the working group in April the authorities of Medical Department of Ministry of Home Affairs (that also embrace policlinics) took the decision on the creation of the Anticorruption commission in the composition of 9 people.</p> <p>Members:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Co-chairman: Dr. Andrei Borsevski (Executive Director of the Center for Development of Democracy and Civil Society of the Republic of Moldova); 2. Co-chairman: Nelyu Prodan, Head of Analysis and Control of Medical Department of Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Moldova; 3. Tatiana Sergeeva (Institute for Democracy); 4. Maria Șumleanski (Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs); 5. Tatiana Mura (Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs); 6. Lucia Leășev (section chief, Hospital of the Ministry of Home Affairs); 7. Ecaterina Josan (Hospital of the Ministry of Home Affairs); 8. Ludmila Mazolu (president of the trade union committee of the medical staff, Ministry of Home Affairs); 9. Aurelia Burghilea (Laboratory Head, Medical Department of Ministry of Internal Affairs). <p>In April at the sitting of the Anticorruption commission they adopted the plan of the commission's activities, and they also took the decision on the working out of the Code of Anticorruption Ethics. In May the Code of Anticorruption Ethics was analyzed, and the</p>	<p>In order to improve the quality of the work of the council two co-heads will work in it (one is the independent head, the salary will be according to the budget of the project; the other is the representative of Medical Department of Ministry of Internal Affairs, he will work on volunteer basis).</p>

	<p>commission recommended to adopt the Code. In the composition of the commission there are representatives of the authority of policlinics, trade union, NGOs of Moldova. The commission hold the sitting not more seldom than once a month, and it will examine the cases of corruption in the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs of the Republic of Moldova.</p> <p>In June, at the sitting of the commission the program of anticorruption events of educative character in the policlinics was analyzed and adopted. The program has embraced the anticorruption seminars and the control of the acquisition of the learning material. Also, at the same sitting of the commission the activity of medical collaborators in the first quarter of year 2010 was analyzed. In addition, the draft of the Code that was presented for its second revision was discussed. In July, the complaints that were found in the anticorruption box were analyzed, and at the same sitting the final draft of Code of Anticorruption Ethics was adopted. In August, the claims that were taken from the anticorruption box were considered. In addition, the recommendation on the publication of the Code in the Romanian language like a separate brochure was adopted. In the commission's opinion the publication of the Code as a small brochure would be convenient and very useful for patients.</p> <p>In June, at the sitting of the commission the program of anticorruption events of educative character in the policlinics was analyzed and adopted. The program has embraced the anticorruption seminars and the control of the acquisition of the learning material. Also, at the same sitting of the commission the activity of medical collaborators in the first quarter of year 2010 was analyzed. In addition, the draft of the Code that was presented for its second revision was discussed. In July, the complaints that were found in the anticorruption box were analyzed, and at the same sitting the final draft of Code of Anticorruption Ethics was adopted. In August, the claims that were taken from the anticorruption box were considered. In addition, the recommendation on the publication of the Code in the Romanian language like a separate brochure was adopted. In</p>	
--	--	--

	<p>the commission's opinion the publication of the Code as a small brochure would be convenient and very useful for patients.</p> <p>The complaints from the anticorruption box are considered at sittings of the Anticorruption commission.</p> <p>The meeting held in September was dedicated to the Code implementation analysis and the analysis of complaints and suggestions submitted to the Anticorruption box. The success related to implementing the Code was mentioned. Besides, 18 complaints and suggestions were considered. Most of the complaints referred to dissatisfactory conditions and poor technical and material basis of the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs. In addition, some complaints referring to hospital admission refusal were submitted, too.</p> <p>The following decisions were taken during the meeting:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Inform the staff of the ambulatory clinic and that of the other institutions at the Ministry of Internal Affairs Medical Department (hospital, regional centers) of the Staff Code in a detailed way; 2. Include using the Code in the Medical Department data reporting (this decision will allow using the Code after our project is over, as using the Code shall be permanently controlled); 3. The Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs administration shall be provided detailed information of complaints and suggestions submitted to the Anticorruption box. <p>The meeting held in October was dedicated to the steps taken in order to eliminate the drawbacks revealed earlier. The Anti-corruption Commission members were informed of the fact that V. Chiaburu, Head of the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs, would inform the Committee of the steps taken due to patients' messages.</p> <p>M. Tataroi, Deputy Head in Charge of Polyclinic Care, was warned of registering hospital patients and monitoring this process.</p> <p>In addition, 9 messages submitted to the Anticorruption box were considered.</p> <p>During the meeting, the Anti-corruption Commission</p>	
--	---	--

	<p>took a decision of constantly observing the doctors' and staff's activity in view of complying with the Code.</p> <p>The meeting held in December was dedicated to analyzing anticorruption achievement and drawbacks in 2010.</p> <p>The meeting held in November was marked by presenting the information regarding the decreasing number of doctor consultation refusal cases. Besides, a report of the steps taken by the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs Administration in view of patients' complaints was considered. It was mentioned that the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs doctors were regularly discussing the ethical code, which was very useful. During the meeting, the anticorruption box was opened, and five complaints were taken out of it. The complaints referred to the fact that some of the patients had been faced with a Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs service refusal. Due to this, the report of the persons in charge who informed the audience that the cases in question had been caused by the territorial principle was considered.</p> <p>The following decision was taken during the meeting: Keep constantly controlling the doctors' and medical staff's activities in order to exclude corruption cases and control the ethical code implementation.</p> <p>The essential Anti-corruption Commission recommendation is implementing an anticorruption project not only at the Ministry of Home Affairs Polyclinic, but throughout the Ministry of Internal Affairs medical department (the Ministry of Home Affairs medical department includes the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs, the hospital, and several regional centers). The medical department administration has sent a request in view of anticorruption activities at the hospital and the regional centers of the Ministry of Home Affairs medical department to the ministry and our organization.</p> <p>The Anti-corruption Commission has actively</p>	
--	--	--

	<p>collaborated with the ministry, and patients have revealed a positive attitude towards it. This is exactly why the Ministry of Home Affairs medical department has asked us to organize a number of visiting sessions at the regional centers. The existence of the committee and anticorruption box serves as an important anticorruption mechanism. Patients may address the committee, and the latter shall consider their applications and take appropriate steps. Besides, the committee analyses complaints submitted via anticorruption boxes, and staff assessment on the Code of Anticorruption Ethics of the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs and the anticorruption lectures held is scheduled. In addition, the committee has developed anticorruption activities and worked out the mechanism of implementing the Code of Anticorruption Ethics of the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs.</p> <p>See in attachment: Anti-corruption Commission’s protocols.</p>	
<p>3. The making and the placement in the building of the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs the anticorruption box.</p>	<p>The installation of the anticorruption box was positively accepted by the patients of the policlinics of the Ministry of Home Affairs. We came to final agreement with the authorities of the policlinics about the installation of the box in March, and in April the order on the installation of the box was issued. The box was ordered and later after its being made it was installed in the hall of the Policlinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs in May. In addition the anticorruption box was installed in the hospital of the Ministry of Home Affairs.</p> <p>The complaints from the anticorruption box are considered at sittings of the Anticorruption commission.</p> <p>See in attachment: Anti-corruption Commission’s protocols.</p>	<p>Instead of the one anticorruption box that was planned they have made and installed two ones: one is in the policlinics of the Ministry of Home Affairs, the other is in the Hospital of the Ministry of Home Affairs.</p>
<p>4. The elaboration and adoption of the Code of Anticorruption Ethics of the Polyclinic of the</p>	<p>The anticorruption commission has adopted the decision on the working out of the Code. After the study of the law on “About Health Protection”, the International Code of Medical Ethics of the World Medical Association and the Geneva Declaration (the International Oath of Doctors) we presented the</p>	<p>As planned</p>

<p>Ministry of Home Affairs of the Republic of Moldova.</p>	<p>draft of the Code. After the Anticorruption commission considered the draft of the Code it was presented for its adoption. The Code was accepted on July, 30.</p> <p><i>Detailed description:</i> We discussed the Code of Anticorruption Ethics of the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs with the Polyclinic staff before adopting it. This is one of the reasons why it took so long to adopt the code. While preparing the final variant of the code, we took remarks of the Ministry of Home Affairs Polyclinic administration, staff, and patients into account.</p> <p>The Code of Anticorruption Ethics of the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs has been developed by our specialists with the participation of the Ministry of Home Affairs Polyclinic staff and patients.</p> <p>After the study of the law on “About Health Protection”, the International Code of Medical Ethics of the World Medical Association and the Geneva Declaration (the International Oath of Doctors) we presented the draft of the Code. The initial variant of the code was developed in accordance with the results of the questionnaire and the requests of the Ministry of Home Affairs Polyclinic staff and patients. The draft of the code was considered by the Anti-corruption Commission and improved on the basis of the committee’s remarks. We wanted to make the code efficient and important; this is why adopting it took so much time. Foreign codes of ethics were analyzed before adopting the code. As a result, the final variant of the Code of Ethics included the Polyclinic staff recommendations and requests of the Polyclinic doctors and patients.</p> <p>Adopting the code has been perceived in a positive way. Thus, the authorities of the Ministry of Home Affairs asked us to publish it not only in collection of laws “No corruption!”, yet in a special booklet (in order to provide information for a larger audience). We were able to fulfill this request by using our own financial resources.</p> <p>The Code of Anticorruption Ethics of the Polyclinic</p>	
---	---	--

	<p>of the Ministry of Home Affairs has been officially adopted (by the decision of the Anti-corruption Commission and the head of the Ministry of Home Affairs medical department). The decision of informing doctors and patients of the code and developing the mechanisms of control over the way the Code of Ethics is observed has been taken.</p> <p>Contents of the Code: preamble, 8 chapters, 53 articles, and the Declaration of Geneva (an international medical oath).</p> <p>Chapters of the Code: Doctor and Society; Doctor and Patient’s Rights; Doctors’ Collegiality; Patient Confidentiality; Scientific Research; Terminal Care; Information and Advertizing; Limits of the Code of Ethics and Liability for Breaching It; The Declaration of Geneva (an International Medical Oath).</p> <p>We have also translated the Code into Romanian and published it as a separate brochure of 16 pages for our own money. Moreover, we have started distributing it among the people in the policlinics.</p> <p>Was presented: Code of Anticorruption Ethics and order (Report 2).</p> <p>Was presented: Order - control mechanisms for the implementation of the Code of Anticorruption Ethics (Report 2).</p>	
<p>5. Round table for the management of the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs.</p>	<p>Not yet started</p>	
<p>6. The publication of the collection of laws “No corruption!”.</p>	<p>The given book was published in the circulation of 2000 copies. The collection of laws “No corruption!” includes anticorruption laws and decisions taken by the Parliament of Moldova.</p> <p>We have started distributing it. In the brochure there is a description of corruption in Moldova and methods of struggle against corruption.</p> <p>In addition, in the brochure there are the following normative acts.</p>	<p>As planned</p>

	<p>In the brochure there are the following normative acts: the Penal Code (excepts), the Code on Law Violations (excepts), the Law on Prevention of Corruption and Struggle against it, the Law on the Center for Struggle against Economical Crimes and Corruption, the National Strategy on Prevention of Corruption and Struggle against it, the Resolution on the Adoption of Regulation on the Mechanism of Revealing and Monitoring the Level of Corruption in the Bodies of Public Power, the Resolution on the Adoption of the Methodology of Evaluating Risk of Corruption in Public Institutions, and, finally, the Resolution on Measures on Prevention of Corruption and Protectionism in Public Bodies. In the attachment there is the Code of Ethics and hot anticorruption lines (the numbers of telephones of the state and non-governmental organizations that struggle against corruption).</p> <p>As the Law on Prevention of Corruption and Struggle against it was taken in 2008, publishing it in the collected volume was very useful (the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs did not have a copy of this law). Besides, many decisions taken by the Parliament have been published for the first time, and they were unknown to Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs administration; moreover, the patients were unaware of it. The Law on Prevention of Corruption and Struggle against it is published in the collection of laws. The knowledge of the Center’s powers and functions shall help the reader combat corruption while addressing the Center in question. Besides, the Code of Anticorruption Ethics of the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs and anticorruption hotline telephone numbers are published in the collection of laws “No corruption!”. The collection of laws “No corruption!” contains anticorruption acts which will help the Polyclinic administration estimate the corruption level, combat it, and give the readers a possibility of learning about the methods of combating corruption.</p> <p>“Knowledge itself is power”, Francis Bacon’s famous statement reads. This collected volume represents knowledge necessary for combating corruption in an effective way. A questionnaire reveals the fact that patients read this collective</p>	
--	---	--

	<p>volume with interest. The fact that the Center for Combating Economic Crimes and Corruption, the Ministry of Home Affairs, and NGO anticorruption telephone numbers are published in the collective volume has been especially appreciated.</p> <p>The collection of laws is distributed among the patients and doctors of medical institutions of Moldova for their anti-corruption education (thanks to the growth of their knowledge about the methods of resistance to corruption).</p> <p>Was presented: Book-collection of laws “No corruption” (Report 2).</p>	
7. The publication of 30 000 leaflets “Patients’ Rights”	The leaflets were published in April. At present the leaflets are spread in the medical institutions of Moldova.	As planned

Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs has invited the Center for Combating Economic Crimes and Corruption members to lecture on anticorruption topics, in accordance with the Anticorruption Commission recommendation. Such series of lectures are to be held independently, they are not included in our project. I should mention that our project has encouraged the Polyclinic of the Ministry of Home Affairs administration: they are impressed by the project and its great efficiency, and they have started taking anticorruption steps by themselves. Thus, we can see they will be able to go on independently after the project is over.

IV. Financial Report

1. PTF grant amount: USD 27000
2. PTF grant received so far: USD 27000
3. PTF grant spent so far: USD 22298,6⁴
4. PTF grant remaining to be disbursed: 0 USD
5. Expected date PTF will be requested to make next tranche disbursement
6. Financial Report (Table below):

As of date (US1=11,89 local currency)

Budget Category*		Budget (USD)	Total Actual Expenses (USD)	Total Actual PTF Expenses (USD)	Actual Expenses for period (USD)	Sources of Funding Used		
						(currency)	(USD)	Our Contribution (MD currency)
A	SALARIES							
	1 Project coordinator	3840	2880	2880	960	11414,4	960	
	2 Project assistant	3360	2519,7	2519,7	840	9987,6	840	
	3 Chairman of Anti-corruption Commission	3360	2519,7	2519,7	840	9987,6	840	
	4 Project accountant	3120	2340,3	2340,3	780	9274,2	780	
	5 Taxes	3625	2718,6	2718,6	906,3	10775,9	906,3	
	Total A	17305	12978,3	12978,3	4326,3	51439,7	4326,3	
B	HONORARIUMS							
	1 Honoraria for writing of Code of Anticorruption Ethics	800	800	800				
	2 Honoraria for 3 poll workers	1320	1320	1320				
	3 Honoraria for moderator (for round table)	200						
	Total B	2320	2120	2120				
C	EQUIPMENT							
	1 3.1. Computer	800	800					
	2 3.2. Laser printer	500	500					
	Total C	1300	1300					
D	PUBLICATION							
	1 Publication of the collection of laws	3600	3600,3	3600,3				
	2 Publication of the leaflets (two-sided printing) "Patients' Rights"	3600	3600	3600				
	Total D	7200	7200,3	7200,3				

Budget Category*	Budget	Total	Total	Actual	Sources of Funding Used
------------------	--------	-------	-------	--------	-------------------------

⁴ The total figure should be the same as in the Table below under PTF column.

		(USD)	Actual Expenses (USD)	Actual PTF Expenses (USD)	Expenses for period (USD)	PTF		Our Contribution
						(currency)	(USD)	(MD currency)
E	LUNCH							
	1 Lunch for participants	120	0		0			
	Total E	120	0		0			
F	OTHER DIRECT COSTS							
	1 Office expenses	850	850					
	2 Payment of Phone and Internet	1440	755,7		143			1700
	3 Room rent	1800	1350		450			5350
	4 Banking charges	404	283,8		49			585
	Total F	4494	3239,5	0	642	0	0	7635
	Total (A+B+C+D+E+F)	32739	26838,1	22298,6	4968,3	51439,7	4326,3	7635
* These categories are reproduced from the original project budget.								
** Use data from the original budget.								